****

**EEB Evaluation Committee Monthly Meeting MINUTES**

**Monday February 10, 2019 – 10:00-11:26**

Department of Energy and Environmental Protection – Public Utilities Regulatory Authority, Commissioner's Conference Room, OCC, 10 Franklin Sq., New Britain, CT

Meeting Materials in Box folder: <https://app.box.com/s/o8bterrvbpk250iyn3oj6bdc2nzvd30b>

 **Call-In Number: 303/900-3524; WEB Access:** [**www.uberconference.com/skumatz**](http://www.uberconference.com/skumatz)

*USE PHONE (NOT COMPUTER) FOR VOICE, AND MUTE WHEN NOT SPEAKING – very important.*

 *(Backup number – only if primary # doesn’t work –303/317-2078 (no code needed);*

*https://zoom.us/j/2534751779)*

**COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**

**ATTENDEES:** Viglione\*,Wells\*, Li, McLean, Ingram, Oswald, Eigo, Kopylec, Reed, Jacobs, Prahl, Wirtshafter, Skumatz

1. **Public Comment** - none
2. **Minutes from January 2020** – some votes already received; Wells will review and send in votie during call or after (received during call / meeting; added to vote table below)
3. **Non-Project Updates and Issues**
	1. Review Interim progress / highlights;
		* Interim e-votes and meetings – reviewed 1 kickoff in Feb; 5 in Jan plus one final presentation on MF project.
		* Upcoming meetings / reports out for review – no reports out for review. **Highlighted TWO upcoming meetings for Evaluation Committee on the Update to the Evaluation Plan – on 2/19 and 2/29**. These will be discussion calls; documents will be provided from EA team prior to meeting so committee can be ready to review / revise / discuss.
		* Status of Data requests and deliverables – *several immediate issues – Walked committee through the report that details the status of every data request. Decided to review in the GANTT chart discussion*.
	2. SERA January invoice Send for E-vote – not enough voting members on line at the time. Summary – 92% of year remains and 91% of budget. Skumatz noted that the budget used was the one from the EA Team RFP won last July, not the incorrect number included in the adopted 3-year C&LM Plan. Revised budget for EA Team should be corrected as part of March update to C&LM.
4. **Discussion of Status of Contracting**
	1. Status of contracting – UI issued POs week of 2/3/20. We understand data are following as soon as possible. Oswald has attended meetings throughout the process, which has helped, but only if the data come soon. As mentioned above, several projects are really in need / held up. A third repeat of this kind of contracting schedule is not workable. Thank you to ES for getting contracts completed in July/Aug. Oswald noted his attention is on the data. Skumatz noted we would discuss incentives / motivation issues below in “Roadmap” update part of budget, and priority data issues as part of GANTT discussion.

1. **Discussion of Evaluation Plan Update process / documents**
	1. Skumatz noted the Committee call to discuss the Evaluation Plan Update projects is scheduled for 2/19 (should be on everyone’s calendars). Matrix of projects and recommendations to be provided in advance of schedule discussion call. The call will include detailed discussion with committee; and we’ll make revisions during the call and with follow-up. A second committee discussion call is scheduled for 2/28 if needed. (Added later - We can then provide a memo for vote of Evaluation Committee on 2/28 or Eval Committee meeting, with RFPs following directly from these projects / descriptions).
2. **Discussion of Roadmap Revisions** (see memo/marked-up and excel tally table forwarded with meeting documents)
	1. Skumatz described that DEEP requested input from utilities on suggestions to Roadmap and processes to improve evaluation process, timeliness, quality. EA Team had been noting suggestions in multiple meetings, but took the opportunity to provide more integrated input in terms of a markup to this utility memo to DEEP, adding a few items to the Utility list. The marked-up was memo provided in Committee documents for today’s meeting. Lisa then listed the individual issues in a table and solicited opinions on new ones from Ingram (main writer of previous memo) and Reed (for Tech Consultants). Skumatz then walked though and discussed each issue on the table – as follows. Each was discussed by the committee in turn.

Discussion items included:

* Compliments on 2nd kickoff for 1982 – committee felt listened to / worked successfully.
* Interest in improved communication to make sure programs are well-understood – including changes. It was noted that many of these changes focus on moves in that direction, but stay mindful of overarching Roadmap interst in avoiding “undue influence”. Especially important for programs with new or evolving designs or no current participants (SEM, others).
* Speed is also of interest. It was noted that lighting is changing fast, and CT is complicated because the results are used prospectively, so older evalutions are particularly problematic for this measure.
* Explanation of “limitations” for fast feedback; noted faster ways of existing (quarterly surveyes ongoing, etc.), and that some newer techniques not yet proven for impact – but provide useful feedback. Discussion of derivation of Re-curve and current demonstrated capabilities. Prahl noted some of the methods may be faster but are not oriented to rigorous impact evaluation. Skumatz noted some of the drill-down of interest (performance by vendor as soon as possible to allow corrections) can and should be addressed also with sample size if priority. Concerns on tools noted; all interested in shorter feedback loop.
* Concerns about delays and problems that arise from not being able to dialog with companies and contractors; Skumatz noted intersect points now and those suggested from the Edits to the Roadmap in the table below. Email contact (cc’ing EA Team) is currently allowed for data questions.
* On # 13 – Reed noted if changes are wanted they might be needed for March update – so things might have to move apace.

Next steps –

* Some items will be discussed outside this process (incentives – but utilities requested consultation as members of Evalation Committee will need to be reponseible for implementing changes).
* EA Team will provide a revised mark-up of the Roadmap for review by the committee.



1. **Discussion of Projects** (*Gantt, Project Summary Reports Provided monthly w/spend*) 15 min
	1. C&I Projects (Gowans & Jacobs), and Residential Projects (Wirtshafter & Skumatz) were discussed. Gantt chart was discussed (see table in Gantt chart document; elements reproduced below).
	2. Projects with particular data issues to be prioritized by UI included: R1982 (HP) and R1963a & b to allow in-field data collection.
	3. Project by project gantt writeups follow in table below.

|  |
| --- |
| * *C1634. Consultant has completed site visits and meter retrievals for all sites, and is currently concluding analysis. Consultant is performing interviews for the baseline study amendment work.*
* *C1635. Performing last EO electric retrieval visits in February. Performing upstream lighting site visits in February and March.*
* *C1901.Finalizing project design elements based on (ES) materials received. Received program materials and data from Eversource. Waiting on all data from UI and customer data from Eversource.*
* *C1906.Kickoff was 1/28; Work on Research and Development of Refined SEM Evaluation Methods underway - Results Expected June 2020*
* *R1603. Possible follow up work being held pending PSD/HES discussions and prioritization efforts for Update to Evaluation Plan.*
* *R1705/1609. Project complete. Final Results presentation in January, final invoice submitted; data retention confirmation being confirmed.*
* *R1959. Finalized project design, market sizing nearly complete, drafting data collection instruments, data request and calls complete. ES provided requested program materials; UI recently indicated it does not have information to share for the evaluation of this program.*
* *R1963A. Finalized project design, releasing a sales data analysis memo imminently, conducting data collection. ES delivered data in Sept; UI data hold-ups are holding up the project.*
* *R1963B.Continued work with EA Team to refine data collection and sampling plans. Analyzing program participation data to support the development of retailer ad sales volume data collection steps. Gathering information on the regulatory impact on residential lighting opportunity including information regarding lawsuite filed by NRDC and other environmental activist agencies against DOE.*
* *R1965.Finalizing project design, market sizing and literature review in progress, data collection instruments being drafted, data request issued, and data calls complete. Eversource met the 2 January data deadlines; UI missed the originally-scheduled data call/attended rescheduled call 2/5; expect to provide some of the data 2/7. Need data asap for this project AND R1982.*
* *R1973.Conducting literature review, and drafting peer interview guides, targeted at program structure, impact approaches, savings claims, C/E inputs and other issues.*
* *R1982. 2nd Kick-off Meeting scheduled for 2/6/20. Eversource met the 2 January data request deadlines; UI missed the originally-scheduled data call/attended rescheduled call 2/5; expect to provide some of the data 2/7. Need data asap for this project or summer metering cannot occur, delaying project by ~6 months. Data requests are being coordinated with R1965.*
* *X1931. Measure by measure review of PSD, gaps, priority gaps, fast fill / secondary data potential.*
* *X1939. Working on best practices research and stakeholder interviews protocols; Draft Best Practices report, Summer 2020*
* *X1941. We completed data request X1941-1-TRC on 1/8/20. Once the utilities submit the requested data, we will analyze it and develop the sample of projects for on-site verification. We are in the process of reviewing the 2020 CT PSD and comparing the data sources and calculation methods with approaches employed in Technical Resource Manuals (TRMs) from* other regions and states
 |

Joel from UI requested a followup meeting with Skumatz to discuss data. Oswald asked if X1931 will have input for next PSD process / Skumatz said yes, fast fill results.

1. **Recap / reminder of EA Team items for 2020 beyond developing projects: Skumatz read.**
	1. Eval Plan Update
	2. RFPs and contracting for new list of projects from Updated Evaluation Plan
	3. Legislative report early year (streamlined process in place)
	4. Revisions to Roadmap
2. **Other items** – Skumatz asked about progress on these items, and on the second one, whether it is a priority to EEB and worth preparing. Last one was prepared, then pushed from one EEB meeting to the next. Skumatz asked whether Quarterly reports were going to be a continuing thing. Reed said he’d mention / ask at his next leadership meeting.
	1. Update on DEEP / NEEP M&V 2.0 Grant or other projects.
	2. Quarterly report for use by O’Connor in EEB meetings
3. **RECAP – To Do from underlined items above.**
	1. Committee – Eval Plan Discussion meetings 2/19, 2/28. Skumatz to distribute materials beforehand.
	2. Revised budget for EA Team should be corrected as part of March updates to C&LM Plan
	3. UI should work on key data requests – 1982 / 1965, and 1963, among others – projects are at critical points and hold-ups are severely affecting projects.
	4. EA Team work on mark-up of roadmap to reflect 15 changes discussed – with follow-up of committee members, etc. on individual items if complicated in Roadmap
	5. On Roadmap Item #13 (positive and negative performance incentives), if changes are to be implemented as part of the March Update to C&LM plan, progress will be needed soon. Implementation of possible changes may need discussion with Utilty staff on evaluation committee among others (and EA Team to identify trouble-points). Items may need to be discussed outside Evalation Committee process (EEB, other).
	6. Skumatz and Kopylek from UI to discuss data issues.
	7. Reed to find out if Evaluation Quarterly reports (powerpoint) are still needed (have been pushed from agenda regularly; don’t want to do efforts that won’t be used).

\*\*\* Supporting Materials in Box folder and attached before meeting, including:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * Updated Gantt Chart & Project Status Summary & data timeline report
* E-votes / call notes (attached / bottom of agenda)
 | * Minutes for Jan
* SERA Team Invoice
* Memo on Roadmap
 |

***Summary of 2018-19 Votes To Date (updated 2/10/20)***

|  | Minutes for the month | SERA Invoice |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Jan 2019 | Evote in process: In favor O’Connor (1/16) and Wells (2/10), abstain McLean (1/16) | Being e-voted. |
| Dec 2019 | Evote In process: In favor, McLean (1/16), abstain O’Connor (1/16) | Evote: Passed. In favor O’Connor, McLean, Wells all 12/17. |
| Nov 2019 | Evote passed. In favor O’Connor 12/10, McLean 12/19, Wells 1/16) | Evote: Passed. In favor O’Connor 12/10, Wells 12/17, McLean 12/19  |
| Oct 2019 | Evote distributed 10/14, resent 11/8. In favor (O’Connor, 10/15, Wells 11/8, McLean 12/19).  | Evote: Passed. In favor O’Connor 12/10, McLean 12/19, Wells 1/16) |
| Sep 2019 | Evote distributed, 9/9, resent 10/3. In favor (McLean-Salls 9/10, O’Connor 9/10, Wells 10/7 ) | Evote distributed 10/14, resent 11/8. In favor (O’Connor, 10/15, Wells 11/8, McLean 12/19).  |
| Aug 2019 | Evote distributed 8/12/forgot to attach minutes. Resent 9/4; In favor O’Connor 9/6;, Wells 9/9, McLean-Salls not in attendance / abstain. | Evote distributed 9/9, resent 10/3. In favor (McLean-Salls 9/9, O’Connor 9/10, Well 10/7) |
| Jul 2019 | Passed (E-vote O’Connor 7/8, Wells 7/11 both in favor; abstain McLean Salls 7/8); circulated with June’s | Evote distributed 8/12; resent 9/4.In favor (McLean Salls 9/5; O’Connor 9/6; Wells 10/7) |
| Jun 2019 | Passed (E-vote O’Connor 7/8, Wells 7/11 both in favor; abstain McLean Salls 7/8); circulated with July’s. | Passed (E-vote McLean-Salls 7/8, O’Connor 7/8, Wells 7/11) –error in invoice found.**Passed** revised version. 8/2 SENT REVISED INVOICE NOTING CALCULATION ERROR: e-vote in favor from Wells and O’Connor 8/8, McLean Salls 9/5) |
| May 2019 | Passed (E-vote Wells 4/6, O’Connor 4/24/19, Salls 6/6)  | Passed in meeting (Wells, O’Connor, McLean-Salls, 6/10) |
| Apr2019 | Passed (E-vote Wells 4/6, O’Connor 4/24/19, Salls 6/6)  | Passed (E-vote Wells 4/6, O’Connor 4/24/19, Salls 6/6) |
| Mar 2019 | Passed (E-vote O’Connor, 4/1/19, Wells 4/5/19) | Passed (O’Connor, Wells 4/11/19) |
| Feb 2019 | Passed (E-vote O’Connor 4/1/19, Wells 4/5/19) | Passed (O’Connor, Wells evote 4/1/19) |
| Jan 2019 | Passed evote (O’Connor, Wells in favor 1/19; Dornbos abstain 1/19); Wells, correct spelling Bebrin | Passed (Dornbos, O’Connor, Wells e-vote 1/19) |

Removed 2018 dates from the table above. See 2019 minutes / agendas for that summary.

**Other Votes / Meetings / Tracking –**

Feb 2020

* 2/6, 2nd kickoff for R1982 Res HP / HVAC / DHW project

Jan 2020

* 1/31, X1931 PSD Kickoff
* 1/29, C1906 SEM Kickoff
* 1/23, C1901 C&I process kickoff
* 1/15, 11-12, X1939 Early retirement kickoff
* 1/10, 1-2 MF Final Presentation
* 1/8 11-12, X1931 PSD Kickoff

December 2019

* **EVOTE** on accept PSD / HES agreement memo – In favor: O’Connor 12/20, McLean 12/20. Wells in favor of HES value agreement table 1/16/20.
* **EVOTE** on $11,087 dollar adder for EA Team 2019 budget – In favor: O’Connor 12/10; McLean 12/18. Wells approves Nov and Dec budgets / invoices 12/17 (includes $11K).
* 12/20 Kickoff R1973 Retail Non-lighting products, 10:30am
* 12/18 Kickoff R1982 Res HVAC/DHW, 4pm
* 12/6 HES / PSD call with utilities
* 12/6 X1941 MF kickoff, 3p
* 12/5 R1965 HP/HPWH Kickoff, 3p

November 2019

* 11/22, PSD / HES call, 3p
* 11/4 Held kickoff R1959 ST Renovations and Additions

October 2019

* 10/18- final presentation for RASS / Lighting Report
* 10/7 4pm – final presentation of R1644
* 10/4 – Kickoff of R1963 – ST lighting
* 10/2 – discussion on PSD update process

September 2019

* Nothing.

August 2019

* 8/12 – Evote for July invoice, June invoice
* 8/8 – Evote circulated for revised SERA team June invoice (correcting calculation, updating value)
* 8/8 – Memo of final realization results for R1603 released
* 8/5 - R1603 Call walk-through of more granular results

July 2019

* 7/29 – Distributed detailed R1603 HES / IE Impact results and scheduled follow-up call.
* 7/11-7/17 – C1635 - Arc incident issue on metering work. Incident 7/11, note to committee with resolution 7/17; calls and emails with utility, EA, consultants in-between.
* 7/17 R1705 - MF report released for review
* 7/2 Released R1706/11616 Draft Rass / Lighting study for committee review
* 7/2 Released Draft C1644 for review

June 2019

* 6/4 Report R1603 out for review (phase 1); call to be scheduled to discuss priorities for drill down for Phase 2
* 6/10 Legislative report out for review

May 2019

April 2019

* 4/9/19 Released Draft R1617 for review

March 2019

February 2019

* 2/4 Final presentation on NEI study
* 2/7 Intent to bid and questions due
* 2/14 Q&A responses issued, along with 2-day extension on proposal deadline
* 2/28 Proposal responses received

January 2019

* 1/28 RFP issued, with due date of 2/26/19

Removed 2018 tally. See previous minutes / agendas.